



Staff Report

Date: July 5, 2016

To: City Council

From: Valerie J. Barone, City Manager

Prepared by: Justin Ezell, Director of Public Works
Justin.Ezell@cityofconcord.org
(925) 671-3231

Subject: **Considering approval of a three-year Maintenance Services Agreement in the amount of \$510,900 (\$170,300 annually) with West Coast Arborists, Inc. in a form acceptable to the City Attorney to provide tree maintenance services**

Report in Brief

The proposed Maintenance Services Agreement will authorize West Coast Arborists, Inc. to continue providing professional tree maintenance services to the City.

Recommended Action

Staff recommends that the City Council:

1. Waive formal bidding and allow use of the Cooperative Purchase process consistent with the City's Purchasing Policy; and
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute a three-year Maintenance Services Agreement in the amount of \$170,300 annually to West Coast Arborists, Inc. in a form acceptable to the City Attorney.

Background

The City of Concord has a large inventory of trees and has been awarded the prestigious Tree City USA designation for the last 35 years. On-going maintenance of City-owned trees is required to preserve the health, safety, and general welfare of the public. The maintenance of City trees was at one time performed in-house, with two, 2-person crews from the Parks Maintenance Division. As part of the fiscal stability measures taken by the Council during the Great Recession, staffing was reduced to one, 2-person crew, with the expectation that additional tree maintenance support would be provided through a contract service provider.

In 2015, the City of Pleasanton issued a formal Request for Proposals for tree trimming and removal, inventory and other arborist services. After reviewing all proposals, the City of Pleasanton determined that the proposal from West Coast Arborists most fully met the criteria and qualifications for the project. In addition, West Coast Arborists provided the lowest cost per hour for tree maintenance services. West Coast Arborists has been providing services to the City of Pleasanton since May 2000, and the City of Pleasanton has also been very satisfied with their performance.

The City of Concord's purchasing process allows Concord to buy directly from a vendor at a price established by a competitive bid by another public jurisdiction, in this case Pleasanton. The City of Concord has been contracting with West Coast Arborists for approximately six years now, and the Public Works Department has been very satisfied with their performance.

Analysis

When the City of Concord eliminated one, 2-person tree crew during the Great Recession, the City acknowledged that it would be contracting for tree maintenance services to supplement staff efforts. The use of outsourced services is imperative to properly support and streamline not only the maintenance and preservation of established trees, but also to support future plantings. A Maintenance Services Agreement with West Coast Arborists will ensure tree maintenance services continue.

Section 3.10.080 of the Concord Municipal Code defines the process for waiving bidding regulations. Under this section, the City's Purchasing Officer (or designee) can join with other public jurisdictions in cooperative purchasing plans. The Purchasing Officer or designee may also buy directly from a vendor at a price established by a competitive bid by another public jurisdiction, even if the City had not joined with that public agency in a cooperative purchase. That is the process the City followed in connection with the current procurement.

The City of Pleasanton's 2015 competitive bidding process identified West Coast Arborists as the most qualified bidder and established them as having the lowest cost for service. That being said, rates for tree maintenance services have increased substantially since the last time the City awarded a contract for the services. Specifically, on August 22, 2015, a new prevailing wage determination was issued by the Department of Industrial Relations. As a result, the labor rates for tree maintenance services increased from \$10.12 per hour to 14.73 per hour, an increase of 46%.

Staff is recommending that the City Council award a contract for tree maintenance services in the amount of \$170,300 annually. The cost of increasing the City's own, in-house tree maintenance staffing levels to pre-recession levels would be approximately \$236,000 annually in salaries and benefits. Using a contractor for tree maintenance services is approximately 39% less expensive, and it includes both labor and the

City Council Agenda Report

Approve a Maintenance Services Agreement with West Coast Arborists, Inc. to provide tree maintenance services

July 5, 2016

necessary equipment to perform the work, as well as all additional costs such as workers compensation and other benefits.

Alternatives

Tree maintenance services could be performed using 100% in-house labor. Doing so, however, would require several months to purchase equipment, complete a recruitment, hiring and training process, and would cost the City considerably more to perform the same service.

Procurement Process

The City of Pleasanton issued a formal Request for Proposals for tree trimming and removal, inventory and other arborist services. After reviewing all proposals, the City of Pleasanton determined that the proposal from West Coast Arborists most fully met the criteria and qualifications for the project. In addition, West Coast Arborists provided the lowest cost per hour for tree maintenance services. Purchasing Policy under Concord Municipal Code allows the City to buy directly from a vendor at a price established by a competitive bid by another public jurisdiction, even if the City had not joined with that public agency in a cooperative purchase.

Financial Impact

Funds for the first year of this contract are available in the Fiscal Year 2016-17 Parks Maintenance operating budget. Future years costs will be incorporated into future budgets.

Public Contact

The City Council Agenda was posted.

Attachments

1. West Coast Arborists – proposed price schedule for FY 2016-17

City of Concord

Proposed Price Schedule for Contract Year 2016-2017

Tree Maintenance Services
provided by West Coast Arborists, Inc.

Item	Description	Unit	Current Unit Prices	Proposed Unit Prices
1	Grid Tree Pruning	Each	\$ 51.30	\$ 67.00
2	King/Queen Palm Pruning	Each	\$ 51.30	\$ 67.00
3	Washingtonia Palm Pruning	Each	\$ 51.30	\$ 67.00
4	Phoenix Palm Pruning	Each	\$ 184.30	\$ 241.00
5	Palm Skinning	Foot	\$ 11.40	\$ 15.00
Service Request Tree Pruning				
6	0-6" dbh	Each	\$ 51.30	\$ 67.00
7	7-12" dbh	Each	\$ 89.30	\$ 117.00
8	13-18" dbh	Each	\$ 152.00	\$ 199.00
9	19-24" dbh	Each	\$ 237.50	\$ 311.00
10	25-30" dbh	Each	\$ 332.50	\$ 435.00
11	Over 31" dbh	Each	\$ 427.50	\$ 560.00
12	Tree & Stump Removal	Inch	\$ 22.80	\$ 29.85
13	Tree Only Removal	Inch	\$ 17.10	\$ 22.00
14	Stump Only Removal	Inch	\$ 9.50	\$ 12.45
15	Palm Tree Removal	Per man hour	\$ 57.00	\$ 74.65
16	Plant 15-gallon tree w/out root barrier	Each	\$ 117.80	\$ 154.00
17	Plant 15-gallon tree with root barrier	Each	\$ 142.50	\$ 186.50
18	Plant 24" box w/out root barrier	Each	\$ 237.50	\$ 311.00
19	Plant 24" box with root barrier	Each	\$ 269.80	\$ 353.00
20	Plant 36" box w/out root barrier	Each	\$ 712.50	\$ 933.00
21	Plant 36" box with root barrier	Each	\$ 760.00	\$ 995.00
22	Tree Watering	Per man hour	\$ 57.00	\$ 74.65
23	Emergency Response	Per man hour	\$ 85.50	\$ 112.00
24	Crew Rental - 7am to 5pm	Per man hour	\$ 57.00	\$ 74.65
25	Pest Control & Fertilizing	Per man hour	\$ 57.00	\$ 74.65
26	Specialty Equipment	Per Hour	\$ 57.00	\$ 74.65
27	Tree Inventory Updates	Tree site	\$ -	\$ -

The proposed prices reflect a price adjustment of 31.0% to help offset the imposed increases in the State's prevailing wage determination.